

PAPER NAME

**9, KIAI'S TRANSFORMATIONAL LEADER
SHIP IN ESTABLISHING.pdf**

AUTHOR

muhit muhit

WORD COUNT

8653 Words

CHARACTER COUNT

50581 Characters

PAGE COUNT

16 Pages

FILE SIZE

547.1KB

SUBMISSION DATE

Aug 24, 2022 9:44 AM GMT+7

REPORT DATE

Aug 24, 2022 9:46 AM GMT+7**● 2% Overall Similarity**

The combined total of all matches, including overlapping sources, for each database.

- 2% Publications database

● Excluded from Similarity Report

- Internet database
- Crossref Posted Content database
- Bibliographic material
- Cited material
- Crossref database
- Submitted Works database
- Quoted material
- Small Matches (Less than 8 words)

KIAI'S TRANSFORMATIONAL LEADERSHIP IN ESTABLISHING ORGANIZATIONAL CULTURE AT GENDER PESANTREN

Abd. Muhith

Lecturer at State Islamic Institute of Jember

ABSTRACT: *The key success of educational institutions, including pesantren, lies in its leadership aspect. That is through a transformational leadership style which is able to bring changes to the institution. One of the impacts of the change is to shape effective pesantren supported by a strong organizational culture. Therefore, the transformational leadership style applied by KH. Muhyiddin Abdusshomad in pesantren Nurul Islam Antirogo is very effective in establishing pesantren culture and shaping the behavior of all pesantren civitas. This study aims to identify and analyze the transformational leadership style of Kiai (the pesantren leader) when building a pesantren culture. To identify the leadership style of the Kiai, the researcher uses Bass & Riggio's view of four transformational leadership factors: idealized influence, inspirational motivation, intellectual motivation, and individual consideration. The study found that KH. Muhyiddin Abdusshomad built a pesantren culture by implementing Islamic doctrines. The effectiveness of self-leadership of Kiai in pesantren is also not separated from the normative doctrine of Islam, so that the Kiai's transformational leadership style is based on Islamic values.*

KEYWORDS: Transformational Leadership, Kiai, dan Organizational Culture.

INTRODUCTION

Leadership is one of the most studied organizational behaviors (Robbins & Coulter, 2012: 460; Lutans, 2011: 413; Tyson, 2009: 83; Rivai, 2008: 2), including in education (Scheerens, 2012: 1), as also conducted by Davis & Thomas (1989), Barth (1990), Tobroni (2005), Yunus (2009), Raihani (2010), Zamroni & Umiarso (2011), or Hidayah (2016). This proves that leadership aspect becomes an important part in the world of education. Leadership is a very complex process as a result of interaction between leaders, subordinates (followers), and background situation (Nahavandi, 2000: 1, Hanson, 1996: 153). It is natural if researchers and academics strive to "unravel" the mystery behind the success of great leaders by bringing up a variety of perspective views. This framework brings out theories like trait and behavioral theories in which there are two popular studies from Ohio State Studies and the University of Michigan Studies, as well as contingency theories.

This description shows that the key success of educational institutions lies in its leadership aspect (Setiawan & Muhith, 2013: 5; Sallis, 2002: 67). In fact, in the twenty first century, the public recognizes the importance of leadership in the operations of educational institutions. Moreover, the quality of leadership has proven to be a significant distinguishing indicator between educational institutions and outcomes (Bush, 2008: xi). Factually, the quality of leadership is crucial to the achievement of the goals (vision and mission of education), characterized by the ability to manage educational organizations, influence others (subordinates) and team morale, and ability to cooperate (Wahab & Umiarso, 2011: 79). Thus, leadership has a high significance in providing changes to educational institutions.

Similarly, the leadership of *Kiai* in *pesantren* may influence the growth pattern and development of educational institution. As in the pattern of *pesantren* institution changes (Efendi, 2014), *pesantren* business (Indrawati, 2014), *pesantren* financing (Choir, 2016), modernization of education and institution (Anwar, 2011, Anwar, 2017), or a change towards the political dynamics of *pesantren* (Turmudi, 2004; Patoni, 2007; Suprayogo, 2009; Ernas & Siregar, 2010; Sukarno, 2012; Azizah, 2013). It means that *Kiai* leadership has a wide impact, which is not only specified in small groups only. One of the impacts is the *pesantren* culture which, in macro scale, refers to the context of the values and norms of the organizational system. This dynamicity gradually led to some researches that focused their study on leadership correlations with organizational culture changes (Alvensson, 2002: 96), such as Mardiyah's (2012) research on *Kiai* leadership in maintaining organizational culture.

As commonly occurred in any educational institution or other organization, the organizational culture in *pesantren* grows through an evolutive process, arising from the ideas or brilliant ideas of the leader - the creative ideas of the *Kiai* (Khozin, 2016) - and followed by his followers. This framework by Robbin (2001: 510) suggests that "when an organization takes on institutional permanence, acceptable modes of behavior becomes largely self-evident to its members". Therefore, the *Kiai* directs all human resources (*pesantren's* sivitas) to participate in their actions or activities in order to maintain and build the *pesantren*. *Kiai* himself feels responsible for maintaining religious education (Umar, 2014: 47), because he is the absolute source of power and authority in the life and environment of *pesantren* (Dhofier, 2011: 94), owner (Sukamto, 1999: 1) or the king in the *pesantren* (Smith & Woodward (Edit.), 2014: 3). Therefore, in Siregar et. al.'s research (2013) found that strong structure and pattern of *Kiai* leadership in *pesantren* will make the *Kiai* plays as the main character.

However, in that context, the *kiai's* leadership style determines the effectiveness of the development of organizational culture. Especially when he faces certain situations with the character, behaviors and personality of *pesantren* that have been built and become a common perception held by the *pesantren* community. Therefore, the transformational leadership style as applied by KH. Muhyiddin Abdusshomad in *pesantren* Nurul Islam Antirogo is massively helpful in order to build *pesantren* culture and form the behavior of all *pesantren civitas*. It is in line with Mead & Andrews (2009: 79)'s statement, leadership style determines the effectiveness of organizational culture.

As for the implications, collective-collegial values and norms have significance for the life of socio-organization of *pesantren* Nurul Islam Antirogo. It formed normative values for *pesantren civitas* in understanding the various dynamics that occur in the *pesantren* environment. The result of its understanding eventually becomes a set of basic assumptions (paradigms) that are normative, interrelated and patterned, functioning as consultative values to handle important issues in *pesantren's* life. Consequently, according to Sopiah (2008: 181), the formulated values and norms will act as important means of creating harmonious working relationships in which common beliefs diminish opportunistic behavior.

On one hand, the *pesantren* culture has a tremendous impact on the effectiveness of *pesantren* Nurul Islam's performance, which is based on Islamic religious values and norms. In general, the urgency of organizational culture role towards the performance and achievement of the organization has been recognized by many experts such as Robbins (2001) and Deal & Kennedy (1982). Research results show that organizational effectiveness demands a strong culture built of core beliefs, core values, vision and mission that can be both paradigm and driving force for change (Tobroni, 2005: 115). Similarly, a research

conducted by Kotter & Heskett (1992) proves that profit organizations that have high economic performance cannot be separated from the role of its culture. Therefore, the organizational culture within the *pesantren* institution gives the spirit to the growth and development of the Islamic education institution, and becomes one of the pillars of competitive advantage for *pesantren*.

Research Objective

This study aims to identify and analyze the transformational leadership style of KH. Muhyiddin Abdusshomad when building the organizational culture of *pesantren* Nurul Islam Antirogo. Specifically, this study focused on four factors of leading transformational leadership known as 4-I; idealized influence, inspirational motivation, intellectual motivation, and individual consideration. Through these four factors, this research sees and maps the transformational leadership style as one of the effective and humanist leadership styles to build organizational culture in *pesantren*.

Transformational Leadership

Transformational leadership is a leadership style that is able to transform organizations to deal with dynamic change. Therefore, this leadership is said to be “*a leadership perspective that explains how leaders change the team or organization by creating, communicating, and modeling a vision for the organization or work unit, and inspiring employees to strive for that vision* (Suharsaputra, 2010: 124)”. This leadership style empowers their followers and encourages them to “*do more than they originally expected to do. Transformational leaders motivate followers to perform at higher levels, to exert greater effort, and to show more commitment* (Amstrong, 2009: 32)”.

As the result, transformational leader can have a strong influence on the strategic planning of *pesantren*, by setting the direction of organizational goals such as *pesantren* institutions. Abstract-latent issues can be translated into programs that are concrete-manifest. That is, through this leadership style, a leader is able to convey vision for the future and translate to the organizational structure. The *kiai* in this position has a transformative potential, as Steenbrink (1974: 146) points out, the *kiai*'s function in education is not limited to transference and interpretation of the source of Islam, the *kiai* also mediates into the divine realm. The *kiai*'s role affects not only the dynamics of *pesantren*, but also the holistic community institution (Kuntowijoyo, 1998: 257).

Transformational leadership is a leadership process that between leaders and subordinates strives to achieve high level of morality and motivation. This leader tries to build awareness of his subordinates by setting for great ideals and high morality such as glory, togetherness and humanity. *Transformational leadership is practiced when leader intellectually stimulates the subordinates, excites, arouses and inspires them to perform beyond their expectations. By providing a new vision, the transformational leader transform the followers into people who want to self-actualize. Leader by inspiration have won wars by voluntarily demanding highest sacrifices of soldiers in the battlefields. History is replete of various examples of valour and sacrifices. Transformational leadership is beyond the charismatic leadership* (Kondalkar, 2007:242).

The question that arises in this context is how a leadership style is said to be transformative leadership. Some leadership experts such as Nahavandi (2000: 186-187) identified three factors, namely: *charisma and inspiration, intellectual stimulation, and individual*

consideration. Luthans (2011: 430) and Ladkin (2010: 4) state that there are at least four factors, including: *charisma, inspiration, intellectual stimulation, and individualized consideration*. Bass and Riggio (2006: 20-21) identify four factors for declaring a person to apply a transformational leadership style through the *Multifactor Leadership Questionnaire (MLQ)*: *idealized influence, inspirational motivation, intellectual motivation, and individual consideration*.

This study underpinned the views of Bass & Riggio in identifying transformational leadership styles. The development of these leadership factors in the *pesantren* environment can be described as follows: first, idealized influence-charisma as a behavior of transformational leader of *kiai* in giving insight and awareness of vision and mission of *pesantren*, building and raising pride of *pesantren civitas* to the existence of *pesantren* institute, as well as cultivate an attitude of respect and trust in the *pesantren* community towards their own *pesantren* institution; Secondly, *inspirational motivation* is the *kiai's* behavior in spurring high expectations through the utilization of institutional symbols of *pesantren* to focus efforts and communicate the objectives to be achieved by *pesantren* with an effortless medium; Third, *intellectual stimulation* is a form of *kiai's* behavior to improve intelligence, rationality, and systematical problem solving, organized and effectively integrated in *pesantren civitas*; Fourth, *individualized consideration* that is the transformational leadership behavior of *kiai* who continuously gives attention, guidance, creates space and trains *pesantren civitas* specifically and personally.

Based on these transformational leadership factors, KH. Muhyiddin Abdusshomad's leadership in *pesantren* Nurul Islam Antirogo has succeeded in developing *pesantren* institution through strong *pesantren* culture. His leadership style projects the behavior of a leader who seeks to develop an ongoing system by proposing new values, norms, and beliefs that arise from Islamic doctrine. The development continues to move to transform the institutional system of *pesantren* that encourages the development of *pesantren* towards modern *pesantren*. This is in line with Zwell's (2000: 9) view when identifying organizational success, he found that the basis for organizational success is leadership competence, worker competence, and organizational culture that strengthens and maximizes competence.

Organizational Culture

Culture within social context is the whole understanding which includes knowledge, beliefs, arts, morals, laws, customs, and other skills and habits acquired by learning as members of a society (Goodman 1978 : 78). Within the scope of the organization, culture is a tool of values system, beliefs, assumptions, or long-standing norms, agreed and followed by members of a community as a code of conduct and organizational problem solving reference (Sutrisno, 2010: 2). Nahavandi (2000: 34) provides limits that culture is composed of common values built into a certain group. It is a set of norms, customs, values, and assumptions that guide the behavior of a particular group of people. In harmony with these limits, Greenberg and Barton (2003: 515) define culture as a cognitive framework that contains the attitudes, values, behavior norms, and expectations that members of the organization have.

From these limitations, organizational culture can guide the behavior of members to fit the organization's role of game. Through organizational culture, dynamics of life and characteristics of its members can be understood. It is a common way to understand life and membership in organizations that bind members together and influence what they think about themselves and their work (Wagner & Hollenbeck, 2010: 283). When this understanding is

drawn to the sphere of *pesantren*, it can be said that *pesantren* culture is a tool of the values system, beliefs, assumptions, or shared norms built in the *pesantren* environment to guide behavior of *pesantren civitas*. With organizational culture, the *pesantren* community will be bound by a commonly agreed "normative rules".

Interestingly, organizational culture, as Schein observed (2010: 231), was formed and built by the founders of the organization. *Pesantren* values are transmitted through lectures from *kiai* to his pupils. Since there is hardly any sphere of life untouched by the application of the recitation and *kiai* teaching, starting from the purification rituals means of performing worship up to the procedural provisions of the trade permitted by religion. Therefore, the peaching of the *kiai* to the pupils is equal to a process of establishing a complete set of values by means of its own assessment and orientation. The values (mores) created in the form of a series of daily deeds are then known as "the way of life of santri(pupils)" (Wahid, 2010: 7). The way of life of the santri in *pesantren* compared with the outside life of *pesantren*-reading the wider community-has a significant difference. Therefore, *pesantren* by Wahid (2010) is said to be a "sub-culture".

Similar to organizational culture in profit and non profit institutions, *pesantren* culture has several main attributes. These attributes include: a). Values, namely shared beliefs and philosophy of its members; B). Organizational heroes or exemplars, which are members of the organization that have the best personalities and have strong values about organizational culture; C). The ritual, which is a symbolic ceremony to celebrate and strengthen the interpretation of organizational values; and D). Cultural communication network, that is the desired interaction channel to introduce members to organizational culture (Soetopo, 2010: 124). Armstrong (2009: 141-143) maps four major attributes, namely values, norms, artifacts, and management styles.

Schein (2010) classifies attributes in three layers, a). The first layer includes artifacts and creations that seem real but often can not be interpreted; B). The second layer has values that are important to people. Values are consciousness, affective desire, or desire; and c). The third layer is a basic assumption created by people to guide their behavior. Included in this layer are assumptions that tell the individual how to be perceived, thoughtful, and sympatic about work, performance goals, human relationships, and peer performance. Unlike the previous opinions, Kotter and Hassket (1992: 5) divide attributes on two levels: a). Unseen shared values, beliefs and important goals shared by groups that will shape group behavior and often persist and are difficult to change; And b). Explicit values of group behavior, the prevalent or pervasive way of acting found in a group and persisting because group members behave in this way and teach new members, but the later is easier to change.

Based on the above mentioned expert classifications, the researcher follows the classification pattern developed by Edgar H. Schein. The pattern disentangles simplistic attribution by grouping between manifest and latent; physical and value (abstract aspect). Leaders-read *kiai*-can easily determine the direction of construction that they want to grow in their institutions. The range can be interpreted as an option for leaders to parse the growth of organizational culture.

Therefore, in the context of *pesantren*, the classification of *pesantren* culture needs to be seen critically by the *kiai* in order to open dialogical space with users and stakeholders of *pesantren*. The classification needs to be used as the main study for the socialization process of *pesantren*, since it is undeniable that the organizational culture has a very urgent role to the

success of the organization including *pesantren* for several reasons, such as: first, to give members their organizational identity; second, to facilitate collective commitment; third, to improve the stability of social systems to reflect that the work environment is perceived positively and reinforced, conflict and change can be managed effectively; and fourth, to shape behavior by helping members to be aware of their surroundings (Kreitner & Kinicki, 2001: 73).

From several reasons, it can be concluded that the function of organizational culture in *pesantren* lies in the strength of its functionality. Strong organizational culture becomes a powerful tool to guide *pesantren civitas* behaviors help them do job better. On the other hand, it can reveal the polarity of the *pesantren* when facing internal and external challenges. All these implications will lead to improving the performance of *pesantren* to realize the vision and mission of the institution. As Kotter & Heskett's research (1992: 9) states, an organization that emphasizes culture can increase its income by 682% compared to non-culture organizations, which can only increase its income by 166% within 11 years. In the view of Marno & Supriyatno (2008: 141), the culture of educational organizations has a real impact on the achievement of educational goals; or even to the success and failure of educational organizations.

***Kiai* Transformational Leadership and *Pesantren* Organizational Culture.**

Building *pesantren* Nurul Islam Antirogo culture, as performed by KH. Muhyiddin Abdusshomad, is a conscious and planned effort arising from his ideality. The main objective is improving the performance of *pesantren civitas* including the aspect of strengthening the dynamics of institutional *pesantren*. It is unusual if its leadership style tends to integrate between intuition and sensitivity, creative opinion and strength, and perseverance to design a blend of educational strategy and *pesantren* culture. Factually, positive behaviors of transformational leadership have strong implications for institutional governance (Rahmi, 2014: 139); as suggested by Aydogdu & Asikgil (2011) and Bica & Firica (2010), which conclude the relationship between transformational leadership and organizational culture that is seen as the key to increasing commitment, productivity, and profitability as well as organizational effectiveness.

Therefore, the *kiai* among their followers in *pesantren*, have high awareness of their position as central and role models. In *pesantren* Nurul Islam Antirogo, the establishment of *pesantren* culture is built not only from KH. Muhyiddin Abdusshomad initiation. The magnitude of its influence determines the methods, beliefs, behaviors, and actions undertaken by *pesantren civitas*. In one study, Soebahar (2004) points out the role of the *kiai* in creating democratic and inclusive attitudes to respond to gender issues and provide the *pesantren* he leads as a platform for conversation and the movement of women's empowerment. Until now, the thinking and attitude of *kiai*'s moderation can inspire the birth of gender relation in *pesantren* so that *pesantren* Nurul Islam Antirogo is considered as Gender *Pesantren* in East Java.

Interestingly, KH. Muhyiddin Abdusshomad's moderate and progressive attitude in addressing the normative texts of Islam-al-Qur'an and al-Hadith is very clear. He is courageous to reinterpret the text to suit the context of modern life. Classical texts such as the Book of 'Uqud al-Lujjain which is widely used as the legitimacy of gender imbalances are strictly forbidden by the *kiai* unless they are interpreted in the spirit of equality of men and women (Soebahar, 2004). This formula indicates the innovations initiated by the *kiai* and

reflected by the integration of individual interests of the *pesantren civitas* with their institution.

Gradually, the construction of ideas and attitudes of the *kiai* are incarnated in the structure of institution *pesantren* value. This value is regarded as a measure, containing the truth about the beliefs and behaviors of the *pesantren civitas*, so that this value is the most adhered to and used in any decision-making event. Similarly, the implementation of *pesantren* educational activities cannot be separated from these values as rules and guidelines described in each behavior.

Outside the *pesantren* environment, the value is a form of factor, driving the behavior of *pesantren civitas* and encourage the *kiai*'s superiority compared with other *pesantren civitas*. One of the most prominent behaviors is the attitude of tolerance (*tasamuh*), that is by respecting the differences and respecting other people or groups who have different life principles. This value arises based on the interpretation of the *kiai* on the text of the Qur'an surah Thaaha verse 44 about the dialogue of prophets Moses, prophets Aaron and Pharaoh. Other attitudes are balance (*tawazun*) and fairness (*i'tidal*) derived from the *pesantren* ideology based on the practice and tradition of Nahdlatul Ulama '(NU) religious organization.

Their commitment to the values has driven the attention of the *pesantren civitas* to be aimed entirely at the substance of education of *pesantren*. At this time, the *kiai* provides inspiration and motivates *pesantren civitas* to see wider and more varied opportunities. He invites them to achieve high standards of success by creating spaces of creation. It is not unusual in the *pesantren* Nurul Islam Antirogo if there is a community of female pupils playing soccer or volley ball. However, this freedom is not without limits, this freedom is limited by the Islamic ethical values raised from the moderation of understanding of classical texts (classical holy books).

The pattern encourages the *kiai* to form mentality and morality of a strong *pesantren* member. The internalization of the normative values of Islamic character is further strengthened through the process of doctrination and habituation. Their space of creation is framed by Islamic culture derived from the Qur'an such as the value of monotheism (QS Al-Ikhlâs: 1-4), ethics or *akhlaq al-karimah* (Surah al-Baqarah: 177), the value of honesty (QS At-Taubah: 119), responsibility (Surah Al-Mudatstsir: 38), or respecting the laws and regulations (Surah an-Nisa ': 59). *Kiai*, in the process of developing the *pesantren* culture, does so as it is planned, directed, and focused on the goal. The *pesantren* community is directed to understand, live and practice the values through various types of formal education activities (MTs / SMP, MA / SMA / SMK) for the development of integrated *pesantren* culture. On the other hand, the efforts to build a *pesantren* culture are integrated with "normative clock" of formal education that does not interfere with their substantive set schedule of Teaching and Learning Activities (KBM). Through the process of integration, educational personnel have responsibility in the form of teaching (worldly domains) and guidance (*ukhrowi* domain). He is not only required to carry out academic obligations (teaching), but also required to train, guide and pray for learners.

Observing the dynamic initiation of the *pesantren's* culture, *kiai* has an important role as layers of knowledge of how to behave in *pesantren*. All the behaviors of *pesantren civitas* refer to the system of ideas, the socialized behavior, and the results of behavior that will or has been felt. The researcher sees the systematic idea of *pesantren* culture raised by *kiai* from the social construction of mind and the *kiai's* construction of knowledge. Meanwhile, the

behavior in which there is a communicating system is articulated in the form of a patron-client system and is dialogical. The result of such behavior is based on social construction of *pesantren*'s science system which is commonly derived from classical texts (yellow book).

As the *kiai* occupies a central position, he positions himself as a role model (*uswah hasanah*) who does not rely on his own personal charisma. Since the *kiai*'s attitude that upholds the pluralism in the environment of *pesantren*, he invites *pesantren civitas* to appreciate the differences in society. In fact he distributes his authority to his young fellows as a series of *pesantren* empowerment and encourages them to become leaders. In this context, however, the *kiai* does not impose his will to be done by the *pesantren civitas*; firstly, he understands their potential, ability and emotional stability. The sensitivity of the *kiai* is said to be an intellectual empathy (Rahmi, 2014: 183).

Upon reaching the increasing of potential of *pesantren civitas*, the *kiai* continues to make some betterment and improve other aspects. The potentials and competencies of the *pesantren* are opened for distribution, so that all of them can increase their potential. Through such pattern, he creates harmony and ultimately encourages *pesantren civitas* to develop self-discipline as well as to realize the goal of education *pesantren* Nurul Islam Antirogo. KH. Muhyiddin Abdusshomad underlies the foundation with normative value of the Qur'an, surah An-Nisa 'verse 32 which describes the necessity of a just attitude. Theoretically, Barnes (1998, in Uha 2013: 158-160) has identified ten Kaizen leadership principles, similar to the *kiai*'s.

Kiai has a sophisticated ideal of the *pesantren* that he built; the values and beliefs are adapted to Islamic ethics. However, he is elastic in responding to the condition of the *pesantren* environment in order to continuously make improvements and changes. Consequently, in the process of building the *pesantren* culture there is thesis and antithesis to achieve conformity. Interestingly, after reaching this conformity the *kiai* does not stop but he performs innovative creations. He is restless within the sphere of the status quo and invites the *pesantren civitas* to continue to transform the system in a better direction.

Those processes are forms of actualization of the Qur'an surah Al-Maidah verse 16. The concept of "*min al-dhulumat ila al-nur*" is interpreted as a transformative process from low point to high point. This process can also be interpreted as a metamorphosis of *pesantren* institution to modern *pesantren* culture with various prestigious Islamic educational ornaments. *Kiai* has designed the transformation of the *pesantren* institution's culture through the internalization of values and beliefs that gave rise to a sense of pride in *pesantren*. One example is the white-and-white uniform (white sarong, white koko shirt, and white cap) capable of generating a sense of pride for pupils and at the same time a self-control tool to avoid bad behavior. Every individual who is on a different level from *badal*, *santri*, boarding school administrator or *ustadz* tends to give the same understanding to it.

Although sometimes there is disagreement from internal circles and from community around the *pesantren* itself, the *kiai* builds *pesantren* culture evolutively through critical reading of skill, competence, and environment potential. In addition, the *kiai* combines the conventional *pesantren* management that tends to do preaching with the philosophical value of users or more modern stakeholders. The advantage is that the *kiai* can build new habits within the *pesantren* environment that will unconsciously emerge as a culture.

On the one hand, the culture of the *pesantren* that was formed evolutively has been able to be more adaptive to face the challenges of the times. One example is the birth of vocational education institutions such as vocational schools in the *pesantren* environment. This cannot be separated from the demands of the current era that require graduates to have skills in the field of science but also strong in religious knowledge. Along with the existence of this adaptive dynamics, *pesantren* further strengthens integrative education system (non-dichotomic) between science of religion and general science. Hence, the term "religious scientist" or "scientific religious scholars" has been familiarly heard.

It means, *pesantren* Nurul Islam Antirogo that has a strong *pesantren* culture, has emerged from the self-ideals of the *kiai*. The ideality born of his religiosity followed by the attempt to interpret and translate the Islamic doctrine formulated in the Qur'an and al-Hadith. This process is an attempt of the *kiai* to contextualize Islamic doctrine in the life of *pesantren*. This is fair to the *kiai*, because he has a strong religious tradition of religion and is sustained by a religious family background. Park (2015: 3) indicates that thought is a substance that spreads through consciousness and thought manifests itself as the reason of a tradition. In contrast the stretch of modernization and globalization tends to bring destructive attitudes and exclusion of the religious sense of society. These can be identified in the transnational movement of radicalism in the name of religion, the number of fights between students, or free sex. This mapping indicates that *pesantren* culture is the "result of construction" of *kiai* who is willing to open the dialogue room with other potentials.

Transformational Leadership based on Religious Attitude

There is a wide opportunity enabling the management of *pesantren* to be considered as a professional Islamic educational institution with a high level of effectiveness. This management is able to produce human resource outcomes ready to compete. At this time, *pesantren* is not always in the path of religious preaching, but it has shifted to a more complex dimension. This situation disputes Qomar's view (2007: 59) that traditional *pesantrens* are mostly managed traditionally. The "opportunity" has embodied a mature *pesantren* management's effort by generating effective learning, open organizational adaptation, and having a strong *pesantren* culture. *Pesantren* cannot be separated from the ability of transculturalism to the changes that occur. That is, he not only assimilates and acculturates the culture, but also projects the culture for the future (worldly and ukhrawi).

Therefore, Ziemek (1986: 97) states that in organizing a *pesantren*, the *kiai* focuses not only for economic purposes but for the sake of religion. In Nurul Islam Antirogo *pesantren*, KH. Muhyiddin Abdusshomad's leadership has designed the management of *pesantren* with normative achievements. When designing the standards for achieving educational success, he applies a double standard. The first standard is designed for the attainment of worldly (quantitative) successes such as the mastery of religious and general science, and the second lies in the practice of science for post-life (ukhrawi) (qualitative) life.

The *kiai*'s leadership style is a form of his ability to nurture, guide and manage the *pesantren* through others -read the *pesantren civitas*- in order to transform the *pesantren* optimally, especially to the human resources to achieve the worldly and ukhrawi goals. Gradually, the leadership style of this *kiai* is able to bring changes to institutional *pesantren* through the development of effective managerial governance of education. Hodaifah's research results (2014: 202) indicate that this *pesantren* is able to establish itself in the typology of moderate *pesantren* that teaches the tolerance, moderate books in tolerant environment of *Aswaja*, that

follows *al-muhafadzah ala al-qadim al-shalih* (running old good deeds), and the rule of *al-akhdah bi al-jadid al-aslah* (absorbing better perceived new deeds).

The *kiai* leadership behavior, in addition to building a strong *pesantren* culture, impacts on the creation of an effective and efficient *pesantren* behavioral system. The *kiai* seeks to cultivate socio-cultural desires such as self esteem or self actualization, even the improving needs of the religious level (metaphysical, absolute). It is common that the devotion and commitment of *pesantren civitas* to *pesantren* and the *kiai* is very powerful in order to receive *barakah* (holiness, virtue as an inherent spiritual force). Lukens-Bull (2005: 1) admit that the *pesantren* community generally wants to be able to absorb (receive). Moreover, according to Tan (2011: 56), the *kiai* is set as a source of *barakah* for his followers.

This leader's behavior is the characteristic and uniqueness of *kiai*'s transformational leader. He pays attention to the needs of the *pesantren's civitas* to influence and "master" it, so that they were able to focus their performance on the goal of *pesantren*. He not only pays attention to the needs of *pesantren civitas* personally, but is collective by helping them to grow and develop into a religious leader. He appears as a leader who pays great attention to the humanist side of *pesantren* through the attitudes of nurturing, educating, guiding, and directing. These attitudes are developed on the principle of *amr ma'ruf nahi munkar* that arises from the religious awareness of the *kiai*; This is what is commonly referred to as *tawheed* ethics. Therefore, the leadership behavior of the *kiai* will not be separated from the normative values of the religion it embraces. As mandated in the Al-Qur'an surah Ali Imran verse 118, a leader has to keep walking on a line; the line that has been determined by God.

Based on the religious awareness motive, the *kiai's* leadership behavior in managing *pesantren* is strongly adhering to God's line (al-Qur'an and al-Hadist). The motive will influence, motivate, and mobilize *pesantren civitas* to be guided by religious values. The *kiai* and the *pesantren* community, while raising themselves to higher levels of morality and motivation (such as freedom, justice and humanity), are guided by religious values, not based on mere emotions (such as greed, social jealousy or hatred).

Kiai, in managing *pesantren*, uses the heart and mind as the main aspects. The heart –read intuition- is the medium of building the values of purity in leading an organization, so that the leadership process is colored by obedience without coercion, compassion and sincerity that does not expect any "reward" other than God's gifts and mercy. The mind is used as a medium to think about the dynamics of *pesantren* institution to create innovations and creations that are framed by religious values. Even the Qur'an itself is placed as a paradigm that builds organizational knowledge (management) of *pesantren*. The goal is that all *pesantren* members including the *kiai* himself have the "wisdom" to form behavior that is in line with the system of its religion. Thus, in addition to providing an axiological picture, the Qur'an paradigm can also serve to provide an epistemological insight into management and leadership.

Similarly, within the operation framework of the interpretive methodology, hearts and minds are the main medium for understanding the Qur'an, the activities of the Prophet (as-Sunnah) and the socio-historical setting as well as the dynamics of organizing Islamic education. This interpretation is conducted to re-form the management of intact boarding school, coherent and oriented in the present. That is, the interpretation of al-Qur'an and al-Hadist attempted to be able to reconstruct the management of *pesantren* in accordance with the breath of modernity. Therefore, the *kiai* first formulates the world view of al-Qur'an and al-Hadist such

as ontology, epistemological, and axiological aspects of functional management. From this framework, many *pesantren* cultural values have emerged and formed the personality of Nurul Islam Antirogo *pesantren*.

Therefore, it is appropriate if the kiai leadership steps often bring up the vision and educational innovation that inspire the *pesantren* community. Fundamentally, these behaviors underline the transformational leadership style; as Baharudin and Umiarso (2012: 222) urge, that every subordinate will follow the leader of the organization; a leader who can give them inspiration with a clear vision and with good means and energy to achieve a great goal. Vision becomes the normative reference of the *pesantren* organization movement and is a great hope for the future. Kiai often conveys something "preached" by raising the view and hope of the future that the *pesantren* wants to achieve by combining all the strengths, abilities and potential of the *civitas*.

However, the kiai does not necessarily build great expectations with an autonomous formulation of itself. He, together with other *civitas*, brings together a commitment to build and realize the great hope. One tradition and a cultural value in achieving a shared commitment are through "syuro". In this forum there is a dialectical process to reach a "consensus" that is not contrary to religious values. This deliberation forum serves to accommodate all the aspirations and inspiration of learners and combine thoughts together until the most thoughtful form of thought emerges. Interestingly, the dynamics of this discussion forum emerged in *pesantren* is because of the religious motives of the kiai. *Amanah* is summed up in Qur'an Surah al-Syuura verse 38, which is as a manifestation of kiai's religiousness in *pesantren* management actualized in the style of his leadership.

If it is seen from the Qur'anic verse (Surah al-Syuura: 38) it has been mentioned that believers have the characteristics of: "welcoming" every call of God, establishing prayers, and deliberating their affairs. In the concept of prophetic leadership, as illustrated by Hendrawan (2009: 181), discussion is an integral part of the problem of *amr ma'ruf nahi munkar*. Therefore, the kiai puts the deliberation in a very strategic position to decide and run various educational programs as well as to build the culture of Nurul Islam Antirogo *pesantren*. KH. Muhyiddin Adusshomad does not actualize ideas without any dialogue process with *pesantren* society.

Based on the existing *pesantren* phenomenon, deliberation becomes an essential part to bring about change in *pesantren* Nurul Islam Antirogo. The fundamental style of the kiai's transformational leadership is the democratic process of reaching "consensus" in the guidance of religious values (al-Qur'an and al-Hadith). Changes that occur in *pesantren* through kiai innovations cannot be separated from the main basis of al-Qur'an and al-Hadist as ideology and foothold thinking. The goal is to put the values of management education in accordance with the ideals and vision of Islam on humanitarian social transformation.

All the cultural buildings, ranging from philosophical frameworks to practical values are bound by the basis of religious social transformation. It serves to explain the real condition of *pesantren* today and at the same time provide insight about the change and transformation of *pesantren*, especially in following the changing of modern era. Consequently, clusters of institutional management are derived from an ideology with an interest in transformation; moving from negative to positive. This transformative spirit is what the kiai continuously holds for maintaining and developing *pesantren*, although it still retains the old values that are still relevant to the modern education system. This is to sum up a principle of *al-mukhafadah al-qodim al-shaleh wa al-akhduh bi al-jadid al-ashlah*.

Transformative spirit encourages Kiai to create innovative space for *pesantren* society in improving performance. Occasionally, he provides rewards to motivate them. He believes that one form of effective motivation is through reward system, based on the accomplishment of his pupils with his pupils. Kiai is certain; this method will clearly encourage pupils to achieve maximum work performance. Therefore, the kiai gives various rewards in accordance with their achievements. The higher the achievement they reach, the greater the rewards they receive. This balance pattern is inspired by the principle of justice that was implemented in the prophet Daud era. God commanded the prophet to be a fair leader in deciding cases (Surah Shaad: 26).

In addition to the basis of "achievement" or the achievement of maximum performance; Kiai provides reward driven by feelings of love and affection. In one study it is said that in educational organizations the foundation of love and affection can increase their productivity performance (Setiawan & Muhith, 2013: 75-78). It occurs since this feeling is directly proportional to the recognition of the existence of humanity; in which the *pesantren civitas* feel much humanized by the kiai. Therefore, it is common when Miler & Browning (2010: 7) state that love is able to launch the path of leadership. Through this love and compassion, the kiai encourages the *pesantren* community to reach the present (world living) and the future (ukhrawi) success.

Therefore, this transformational leadership style not only brings about institutional change and educational systems, but also provides a "wisdom" that relies on virtues and religious values. Such a leadership pattern can be said to be religious-based transformational leadership. He not only represents the values of transformational leaders that focus more on the achievement of the objectives and the realization of the vision through the moral and quality performance of the *civitas* (horizontal aspect in constructing *khalifah fil al-ard*), but also focuses on the achievement of Allah's pleasure (vertical aspect in constructing *abdullah*). These two foci are what the researcher termed the concept of leadership, because it refers to the two constructs.

To measure the religious-based transformational leadership style, there are two dimensions. The conventional standard dimension of Multifactor Leadership Questionnaire (MLQ) that has been formulated by Bass, and ethical-religious dimensions such as behavior, which encourages subordinates to be more aware of the importance of the process of achieving results and the results of the enterprise itself (worldly and enduring aspects); encouraging subordinates to advance the interests of the organization rather than individual interests on the basis of socio-religious ethics; increasing the need for higher subordinates such as self-esteem, self-actualization and spirituality (worship to God); encouraging subordinates to cultivate the awareness of the divinity (*tauhid*), so that it helps to arise teo-antropocentric behavior. It is a behavior that brings grace to the organization based on the values of religiosity.

The implications of this theoretical framework are on conceptual leadership design. The theory that is believed to be so far in raising an effective leadership framework does not correlate with the values of religiosity. One of them states that effective leadership is:

“a model of leadership influenced by the theory of Transformational Leadership includes five main components necessary for a strong leader: Communicating Direction, Inspirational Motivation, Problem Resolution, Building the Team, and

Trust. The core of this model is trust because this is the foundation of any effective leader” (Dennis & Meola, 2009:5).

From these five aspects, there needs to be a "revamping" or reconstruction that is by incorporating eschatological-transcendental values (worship to and blessing from Allah). Thus, effective leadership is not only able to bring management of Islamic educational institutions on the order of effectiveness with the productivity improvement of educational institutions and customer satisfaction stakeholders, especially consumers, but also able to fulfill the desired pleasure to God so that the educational institutions *civitas* are capable of conducting *ma'rifah* to God.

Closing

Based on the writer's description it can be concluded that the kiai, in building the *pesantren* culture, does so with the conscious and planned effort that emerges from his idealism as a social-organizational and prophetic actor. In the process, he actualizes the transformational leadership style-through the dimensions of idealized influence, inspirational motivation, intellectual motivation, and individual consideration-based on religious values. It is this combination of values that continually reinforce institutional cultural building for its growth and positive development. Moreover, this combination can achieve the purpose and the realization of the vision of *pesantren* through the high moral and performance of *pesantren civitas* (*khalifah fil al-ard*) and also for the sake of Allah's mercy (*abdullah*).

This religious-based transformational leadership style has positive implications for improving the performance and work attitude of *pesantren civitas*, including on the strengthening of institutional dynamics. This leadership style changes not only oriented to the achievement of the objectives, mission and vision of the *pesantren*, but also focused on the human resources aspect. Therefore, their professional attitude and performance are able to exceed institutional expectations.

REFERENCES

- Alvensson, M. (2002). *Understanding Organizational Culture*. London: Sage Publication.
- Armstrong, M. (2009). *Armstrong's Handbook of Management and Leadership: a Guide to Managing for Results*. London: Kogan Page.
- Anwar, A. (2011). *Pembaruan Pendidikan di Pesantren Lirboyo Kediri*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Anwar, M.A. (2017). *Pengembangan Kebertahanan Kelembagaan Pondok Pesantren dalam Modernisasi Pendidikan: Studi Multisitus di Pondok Pesantren Roudlatul Tholibin Mojosari Loceret dan Pondok Pesantren Miftahul Mubtadiin Krempyang Tanjunganom Nganjuk*, (Summary of Dissertation). Malang: Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim.
- Azizah, N. (2013). *Artikulasi Politik Santri: Dari Kyai Menjadi Bupati*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Baharuddin & Umiarso. (2012). *Kepemimpinan Pendidikan Islam: Antara Teori dan Praktek*. Yogyakarta: Ar-Ruzz Media.
- Barth, R.S. (1990). *Improving School from Within*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Bush, T. (2008). *Leadership and Management Development in Education*. London: Sage Publishing.

- Choir, A. (2016). *Manajemen Entrepreneurship Berbasis Pesantren dalam Pengembangan Sumber Pembiayaan Pendidikan: Studi Multikasus pada Pondok Pesantren Maslakul Huda Kajen Margoyoso, Pondok Pesantren al-Isti'anah Plagitan Pati, dan Pondok Pesantren Manbaul Huda Kembang Dukuhsети Kabupaten Pati Jawa Tengah*, (Summary of Dissertation). Malang: Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim.
- Davis G.A. & Thomas, M.A. (1989). *Effective Schools and Effective Teachers*. Massachusens: Allyn and Bacon.
- Deal T.E. & Kennedy, A.A. (1982). *Corporate Culture: The Rites and Rituals of Corporate Life*. Massachusens: Addison-Wesley.
- Dennis D.J. & Meola, D.D. (2009). *Preparing For Leadership: What it Takes to Take the Lead*. New York: Amacom.
- Dhofier, Z. (2011). *Tradisi Pesantren: Studi Pandangan Hidup Kyai dan Visinya Mengenai Masa Depan Indonesia*. Jakarta: LP3ES.
- Efendi, N. (2014). *Manajemen Perubahan di Pondok Pesantren: Konstruksi Teoritik dan Praktik Pengelolaan Perubahan sebagai Upaya Pewarisan Tradisi dan Menatap Tantangan Masa Depan*. Yogyakarta: Teras.
- Ernas, S. & Siregar, F.M. *Dampak Keterlibatan Pesantren dalam Politik: Studi Kasus Pesantren di Yogyakarta*, in Kontekstualitas Vol. 25, No. 2, 2010.
- Goodman, N. (1978). *Society Today*. United State of America: Gulf & Western Corporation.
- Greenberg J. & Barton, R.A. (2003). *Behavior in Organizational*. New Jersey: Prentice-Hall International, Inc.
- Hanson, E.M. (1996). *Educational Administration and Organizational Behavior*. Massachusens: Allyn and Bacon.
- Hendrawan, S. (2009). *Spiritual Management: From Personal Enlightenment Towards God Corporate Governance*. Bandung: Mizan.
- Hidayah, N. (2016). *Kepemimpinan Visioner Kepala Sekolah dalam Meningkatkan Mutu Pendidikan*. Yogyakarta: Ar-Ruzz Media.
- Hodaifah. (2014). *Urgensi Moderatisme dalam Pendidikan Islam*. Jember: Pustaka Radja.
- Indrawati, N.K. *Management by Inspiration: Implementation of Transformational Leadership on Business at Pondok Pesantren Sunan Drajat*, in Procedia: Social and Behavioral Science 115 (2014), 79-90.
- Khozin. *Pola Interaksi Pesantren dengan Lingkungan Sosialnya dalam Perspektif Sosio-Historis*, in Progressiva Vol.1, No. 1 Pebruari-Juni 2016, 71-90.
- Kotter, J.P. & Heskett, J.L. (1992). *Corporate Culture and Performance*. New York: The Free Press.
- Kreitner, R. & Kinicki, A. (2001). *Organizational Behavior*. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Kuntowijoyo. (1998). *Paradigma Islam: Interpretasi untuk Aksi*. Bandung: Mizan.
- Ladkin, D. (2010). *Rethinking Leadership: A New Look at Old Leadership Questions*. The United States of America: Edward Elgar Publishing, Inc.
- Lukens-Bull, R. (2005). *A Peaceful Jihad: Negotiating Identity and Modernity in Muslim Java*. New York: Palgrave MacMillan.
- Luthans, F. (2011). *Organizational Behavior: An Evidance-Based Approach*. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Mardiyah. (2012). *Kepemimpinan Kiai dalam Memelihara Budaya Organisasi*. Yogyakarta: Aditya Media Publishing.
- Marno & Supriyatno, T. (2008). *Manajemen dan Kepemimpinan Pendidikan Islam*. Bandung: Refika Aditama.
- Mead, R. & Andrews, T.G. (2009). *International Management: Culture and Beyond*. England: Wiley.

- Miller, R. & Browning, S. (2010). *Cleopatra*. New York: Chelsea House Publishers.
- Nahavandi, A. (2000). *The Art and Science of Leadership*. New Jersey: Prentice Hall, Inc.
- Patoni, A. (2007). *Peran Kiai Pesantren dalam Partai Politik*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Qomar, M. (2007). *Manajemen Pendidikan Islam: Strategi Baru Pengelolaan Lembaga Pendidikan Islam*. Jakarta: Erlangga.
- Raihani. (2010). *Kepemimpinan Sekolah Transformatif*. Yogyakarta: LKiS.
- Rivai, V. (2008). *Kepemimpinan dan Perilaku Organisasi*. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers.
- Robbins, S.P. & Coulter, M. (2012). *Management*. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.
- Robbins, S.P. (2001). *Organizational Behavior*. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.
- Sallis, E. (2002). *Total Quality Management in Education*. London: Kogan Page.
- Scheerens, J. (Eds.). (2012). *School Leadership Effects Revisited: Review and Meta-Analysis of Empirical Studies*. New York: Springer.
- Schein, E.H. (2010). *Organizational Culture and Leadership*. San Fransisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Setiawan, B.A. & Muhih, A. (2013). *Transformational Leadership: Ilustrasi di Bidang Organisasi Pendidikan*. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers.
- Siregar, F.M., et. el. *Religious Leader and Charismatic Leadership in Indonesia: The Role of Kyai Pesantren in Java*, in Kawistara Vol. 3, No. 2 Agustus 2013, 117-226.
- Smith B.J. & Woodward, M. (Eds.). (2014). *Gender and Power in Indonesian Islam: Leaders, Feminists, Sufis and Pesantren Selves*. London: Routledge.
- Soebahar, A. H., *Pesantren Gender: Rekonstruksi Tiga Pesantren di Jawa*, in Dialog No. 58 Tahun 2004.
- Soetopo, H. (2010). *Perilaku Organisasi: Teori dan Praktek di Bidang Pendidikan*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Sopiah, (2008). *Perilaku Organisasional*. Yogyakarta: Andi.
- Steenbrink, K.A. (1974). *Pesantren, Madrasah, Sekolah: Pendidikan Islam dalam Kurun Modern*. Jakarta: LP3ES.
- Suharsaputra, U. (2010). *Administrasi Pendidikan*. Bandung: Refika Aditama.
- Sukanto. (1999). *Kepemimpinan Kiai dalam Pesantren*. Jakarta: LP3ES.
- Sukarno. (2012). *Budaya Politik Pesanten Perspektif Interaksionisme Simbolik*. Yogyakarta: Interpena.
- Suprayogo, I. (2009). *Kyai dan Politik: Membaca Citra Politik Kyai*. Malang: UIN-Malang Press.
- Sutrisno, E. (2010). *Budaya Organisasi*. Jakarta: Kencana.
- Tamam, B. (2015). *Pesantren, Nalar dan Tradisi: Geliat Santri Menghadapi ISIS, Terorisme, dan Transnasionalisme Islam*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Tan, C. (2011). *Islamic Education and Indoctrination: The Case in Indonesia*. London: Routledge.
- Tobroni. (2005). *The Spiritual Leadership: Pengefektifan Organisasi Noble Industry Melalui Prinsip-Prinsip Spiritual Etis*. Malang: UMM Press.
- Turmudi, E. (2003). *Perselingkuhan Kiai dan Kekuasaan*. Yogyakarta: LKiS.
- Tyson, S. & Jackson, T. (2009). *The Essence of Organizational Behaviour: Perilaku Organisasi*, Translator: Deddy Jacobus & Dwi Prabantini, Yogyakarta: Andi.
- Uha, I.N. (2013). *Budaya Organisasi, Kepemimpinan & Kinerja: Proses Terbentuk, Tumbuh Kembang, Dinamika, dan Kinerja Organisasi*. Jakarta: Kencana.
- Umar, N. (2014). *Rethinking Pesantren*. Jakarta: Kompas Gramedia.
- Wagner, J.A. & Hollenbeck, J.R. (2010). *Organizational Behavior: Securing Competitive Advantage*. New York: Routledge.
- Wahab, A. & Umiarso. (2011). *Kepemimpinan Pendidikan dan Kecerdasan Spiritual*. Yogyakarta: Ar-Ruzz Media.

- Wahid, A. (2010). *Menggerakkan Tradisi*. Yogyakarta: LKiS.
- Yunus, J.L. (2009). *Leadership Model: Konsep Dasar, Dimensi Kerja, dan Gaya Kepemimpinan*. Malang: UIN Malang Press.
- Zamroni & Umiarso. (2011). *ESQ Model & Kepemimpinan Pendidikan: Konstruksi Sekolah Berbasis Spiritual*. Semarang: RaSAIL.
- Ziemek, M. (1986). *Pesantren dalam Perubahan Sosial*, Translator: Butche B. Soendjojo. Jakarta: P3M.
- Zwell, M. (2000). *Creating a Culture of Competence*. New York: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

● 2% Overall Similarity

Top sources found in the following databases:

- 2% Publications database

TOP SOURCES

The sources with the highest number of matches within the submission. Overlapping sources will not be displayed.

| | | |
|---|--|-----|
| 1 | Naidoo, Virginia. "Preparedness of Female School Leaders for the Four..." | 1% |
| | Publication | |
| 2 | Brits, J.. "Planned Change in a Financial Organisation: a Case Study.", ... | <1% |
| | Publication | |
| 3 | Gephart, Eric Joseph. "Manager-Perceived Intellectual Stimulation Pre..." | <1% |
| | Publication | |
| 4 | Alkadi, Asma Khalid S.. "Emotional Intelligence of Saudi School Leader..." | <1% |
| | Publication | |
| 5 | Diep, Kim. "A conceptual framework for best practices in information li..." | <1% |
| | Publication | |
| 6 | Ocak, Omer. "The Contribution of Organizational and Individual Based ..." | <1% |
| | Publication | |